

Table 2-H-4d
Bay Area to Merced – High-Speed Train Station Evaluation Matrix
Oakland to San Jose Segment

Station = Station Carried Forward **Station** = Station Eliminated = Primary/Secondary Reason for Elimination

Evaluation Criteria	Stations		
	South Alameda Co.	Oakland Airport/ Coliseum	Oakland Terminus Station
	Mowry Avenue (I-880 Alignment Only)	Coliseum BART Station (Hayward/Mulford Alignment Only)	West Oakland
	Fremont Auto Mall Parkway (Mulford Alignments Only)	Coliseum BART Station (WPRR/Tunnel/Mulford Alignment Only)	Lake Merritt
	Warm Springs (I-880/Hayward & WPRR Alignments Only)	I-880/Hegenberger (I-880 Alignment Only)	12 th /City Center
Union City (Hayward/I-880 & WPRR Alignments Only)	Jack London Square		
Maximize Ridership/Revenue Potential.			
Population/Employment Catchment (Year 2020)	4	3	5
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">808,533 employment462,395 population	<ul style="list-style-type: none">593,747 employment250,185 population	<ul style="list-style-type: none">2,565,241 employment1,244,401 population(Assumes station in downtown San Francisco)
Maximize Connectivity and Accessibility.			
Intermodal Connections	4	5	5
	5	5	3
	5	4	5
	5		3
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">I-880 Freeway	<ul style="list-style-type: none">BARTCapital commuter railAC Transit busesConnector to Oakland Airport	<ul style="list-style-type: none">All BART linesAC Transit buses
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">I-880 Freeway (1.5 mi.)Capitol commuter railACE commuter railAC Transit buses	<ul style="list-style-type: none">BARTCapital commuter railAC Transit busesConnector to Oakland Airport	<ul style="list-style-type: none">2 BART linesAC Transit buses

Evaluation Criteria	Stations		
	South Alameda Co.	Oakland Airport/ Coliseum	Oakland Terminus Station
	Mowry Avenue (I-880 Alignment Only)	Coliseum BART Station (Hayward/Mulford Alignment Only)	West Oakland
	Fremont Auto Mall Parkway (Mulford Alignments Only)	Coliseum BART Station (WPRR/Tunnel/Mulford Alignment Only)	Lake Merritt
	Warm Springs (I-880/Hayward & WPRR Alignments Only)	I-880/Hegenberger (I-880 Alignment Only)	12 th /City Center
	Union City (Hayward/I-880 & WPRR Alignments Only)		Jack London Square
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BART • AC Transit buses 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AC Transit buses • Connector to Oakland Airport 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All BART lines • AC Transit buses
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BART • Capital commuter rail • AC Transit buses 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amtrak • Capitol commuter rail • AC transit buses
<i>Minimize Operating and Capital Costs.</i>			
Operational Issues	5	5	4
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None apparent at this time 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Potential joint use by rail transit providers for Mulford and Hayward • None apparent at this time 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All terminals are designed as two track terminals. All can be expanded to four tracks – West Oakland at 1 level & the others at 2 levels. All terminals have tailtracks for storage & inspection, minor servicing & catering
Construction Issues	1	4	2
	5	5	3
	1	5	2
	5		1
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction over active freeway 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WPRR would require construction of aerial structure & station directly adjacent to the BART aerial station 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deep tunneling through Embarcadero area
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None apparent at this time • Relocation of BART & constructing between two operating railroads 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tunneling beneath Laney College • Cut-and-cover, deep tunneling, & deep excavation. Construction under BART station

Evaluation Criteria	Stations		
	South Alameda Co.	Oakland Airport/ Coliseum	Oakland Terminus Station
	Mowry Avenue (I-880 Alignment Only)	Coliseum BART Station (Hayward/Mulford Alignment Only)	West Oakland
	Fremont Auto Mall Parkway (Mulford Alignments Only)	Coliseum BART Station (WPRR/Tunnel/Mulford Alignment Only)	Lake Merritt
	Warm Springs (I-880/Hayward & WPRR Alignments Only)	I-880/Hegenberger (I-880 Alignment Only)	12 th /City Center
	Union City (Hayward/I-880 & WPRR Alignments Only)		Jack London Square
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• None apparent at this time		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Deep tunneling through Embarcadero area & mining of concourse area in Bay mud.• Construction under active railroad
Capital Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Highest cost• Lowest cost• Less cost• Less cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Similar costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Less cost• Lowest cost• Less cost• Highest cost
Right-of-Way Issues/Costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Highest cost• Highest cost• Highest cost• Lowest cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Similar costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Highest cost• Highest cost• Lowest cost• Highest cost
Maximize Compatibility with Existing and Planned Development.			
Land Use Compatibility And Conflicts	5	5	3
			3
			5
			5
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Compatible land uses• Mowry Station requires taking commercial property – compatible• Compatible land uses	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Compatible land uses• Compatible land uses	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Adjacent to BART in mixed-use area, including residential, commercial & light industrial• Underground in mixed use area, including residential & commercial
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Compatible land uses	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Requires taking commercial property	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• In highly developed commercial area – compatible

Evaluation Criteria	Stations		
	South Alameda Co.	Oakland Airport/ Coliseum	Oakland Terminus Station
	Mowry Avenue (I-880 Alignment Only)	Coliseum BART Station (Hayward/Mulford Alignment Only)	West Oakland
	Fremont Auto Mall Parkway (Mulford Alignments Only)	Coliseum BART Station (WPRR/Tunnel/Mulford Alignment Only)	Lake Merritt
	Warm Springs (I-880/Hayward & WPRR Alignments Only)	I-880/Hegenberger (I-880 Alignment Only)	12 th /City Center
	Union City (Hayward/I-880 & WPRR Alignments Only)		Jack London Square
	• Compatible land uses		• Below existing train terminal – compatible
Visual Quality Impacts	3	5	5
	5	5	
	5	3	
	5		
	• Minimal visual impact except Mowry Avenue with high visual impact.	• High visual impact for approach structure for I-880 Station • Other stations directly adjacent to existing major transit stations – minimal visual impact	• Minimal visual impact except for entryways that would need to designed to be attractive and easily distinguished
Minimize Impacts on Natural Resources.			
Water Resources	5		
	• None of the stations are expected to have impacts on critical water resources		
Floodplain Impacts	5	5	5
	4		
	5		
	5		
	• Auto Mall Parkway Station in floodplain	• No stations in floodplain	
Threatened & Endangered Species Impacts	5		
	• No threatened or endangered species were identified for the station areas		

Evaluation Criteria	Stations		
	South Alameda Co.	Oakland Airport/ Coliseum	Oakland Terminus Station
	Mowry Avenue (I-880 Alignment Only)	Coliseum BART Station (Hayward/Mulford Alignment Only)	West Oakland
	Fremont Auto Mall Parkway (Mulford Alignments Only)	Coliseum BART Station (WPRR/Tunnel/Mulford Alignment Only)	Lake Merritt
	Warm Springs (I-880/Hayward & WPRR Alignments Only)	I-880/Hegenberger (I-880 Alignment Only)	12 th /City Center
	Union City (Hayward/I-880 & WPRR Alignments Only)		Jack London Square
<i>Minimize Impacts on Social and Economic Resources.</i>			
Environmental Justice Impacts (Demographics)	5	5	3
		5	3
		3	5
			5
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• All stations are within existing transportation corridors.• The Mowry Avenue site would be closest to residential areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The WPRR Station would be closest to minority housing	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• West Oakland and Lake Merritt Stations adjacent to minority housing. City Center and Jack London Sq in commercial areas
Farmland Imapcts	5		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• No stations located on prime farmland.		
<i>Minimize Impacts on Cultural Resources.</i>			
Cultural Resources Impacts	5		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• None of the stations are in areas with known cultural resources – no affirmative survey conducted		
Parks Recreation/Wildlife Refuge Impacts	5	5	
	3		
	5		
	5		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The Mulford alignment Station is adjacent to the wildlife refuge• All other stations would not affect Parks/Recreation/or Wildlife refuge	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• No station would affect Parks/Recreation/or Wildlife refuge	

1 2 3 4 5
Least Favorable Most Favorable